



Ymyriadau ar gyfer lliniaru effeithiau digwyddiadau diweithdra torfol: Cwmpas ystwyth o'r llenyddiaeth

Lluniwyd gan:

Dr Chukwudi Okolie, Dadansoddwr Tystiolaeth a Gwybodaeth Uwch, Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru; Claire Morgan, Uwch-ddadansoddwr Tystiolaeth a Gwybodaeth, Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru; Salina Khatoun, Uwch-ddadansoddwr Tystiolaeth a Gwybodaeth, Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru

Cyflwyniad	2
Amcanion	3
Y Negeseuon Allweddol	3
Canfyddiadau	4
Opsiynau ar gyfer gwaith pellach.....	7
Dulliau	8
Cyfeiriadau	10
Atodiad A: Dogfen dechnegol.....	11
Atodiad B: Atodiad Chwiliadau	14
Atodiad C: Echdynnu data	17

Cyflwyniad

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn amlinellu canfyddiadau chwiliad a gynhaliwyd gan Wasanaeth Tystiolaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru i nodi tystiolaeth am ddigwyddiadau diweithdra torfol. Bydd y dystiolaeth o'r adolygiad cwmpasu ystwyth hwn yn cael ei defnyddio i gefnogi'r grŵp ymateb a ffurfiwyd i fynd i'r afael â'r cyhoeddiad bod diswyddiadau torfol wedi'u cynllunio yng ngwaith dur Tata ym Mhort Talbot. Cynhaliwyd adolygiad naratif yn 2016 gan Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru i gefnogi'r gwaith o ddatblygu fframwaith yn amlinellu dull gweithredu iechyd cyhoeddus o ymateb i ddigwyddiadau diweithdra torfol. Roedd yr adolygiad hwnnw'n ceisio ateb dau gwestiwn ymchwil:

1. Pa effaith mae diswyddiadau torfol yn ei chael ar gymunedau?
2. Pa ymyriadau sy'n effeithiol ar gyfer lliniaru effeithiau digwyddiadau diweithdra torfol?

Yn ôl Davies et al (2017), mae effaith digwyddiadau diweithdra torfol ar gymunedau yn cynnwys; mwy o gystadleuaeth am swyddi, colli cysylltiadau cymunedol a rhwydweithiau cymdeithasol, straen ar gymunedau sy'n darparu cefnogaeth i weithwyr, straen ar fusnesau lleol, a dibrisio cartrefi mewn ardaloedd yr effeithir arnynt. Mae'n annhebygol y byddai gwybodaeth newydd am effeithiau diswyddiadau torfol ar gymunedau wedi cael ei chyhoeddi ers yr adolygiad gwreiddiol. Bydd y gwaith a amlinellir yma yn diweddarau'r adolygiad hwn, gan ganolbwyntio ar yr ail gwestiwn ymchwil.

Bydd y gwaith a amlinellir yma yn diweddarau'r adolygiad hwn, gan ganolbwyntio ar yr ail gwestiwn ymchwil. Mae'n annhebygol y byddai gwybodaeth newydd am effeithiau diswyddiadau torfol ar gymunedau wedi cael ei chyhoeddi ers yr adolygiad gwreiddiol.

Cynhaliwyd chwiliad cwmpasu o'r llenyddiaeth i baratoi ar gyfer y gwaith hwn. Ni nodwyd unrhyw adolygiad systematig a oedd yn mynd i'r afael yn uniongyrchol â'r cwestiwn ymchwil, felly penderfynwyd canolbwyntio ar nodi'r holl dystiolaeth oedd ar gael ar ddigwyddiadau diweithdra torfol, waeth beth fo'r fethodoleg, gan ddefnyddio dull cwmpasu ystwyth.

Y canfyddiadau a'r casgliadau sydd wedi'u cynnwys yw rhai awduron y ffynonellau ac nid dehongliad gan y Gwasanaeth Tystiolaeth. Mae ffactorau sy'n berthnasol i ateb y cwestiwn uchod a nodwyd o'r astudiaeth sylfaenol a'r astudiaeth eilaidd a gafodd eu cynnwys wedi'u dethol a'u crynhoi'n fyr yn yr adroddiad hwn. Os yw ffactor penodol o ddiddordeb, fe'ch cynghorir i ddarllen y ffynonellau o'r man lle cawsant eu cymryd yn fwy manwl. Os ydych yn defnyddio unrhyw astudiaethau sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn y cwmpas hwn i lywio polisi, mae'n bwysig ystyried cyffredinolrwydd y canfyddiadau i'ch cyd-destun chi.

Mae'n annhebygol y byddai'r chwiliad a gynhaliwyd ar gyfer y cwmpasu hwn wedi nodi'r holl dystiolaeth sy'n ymwneud â'r pwnc hwn, gan nad oedd chwiliadau yn gynhwysfawr, ond yn hytrach roeddent yn canolbwyntio ar nodi adolygiadau systematig cadarn ac astudiaethau sylfaenol o nifer cyfyngedig o ffynonellau.

Amcanion

Cynnal adolygiad cwmpasu ystwyth i nodi tystiolaeth a gyhoeddwyd sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r cwestiwn canlynol:

1. Pa ymyriadau sy'n effeithiol ar gyfer lliniaru effeithiau digwyddiadau diweithdra torfol?

Y Negeseuon Allweddol

- Mae prinder ymchwil academiaidd ar y pwnc hwn – gyda rhai canlyniadau'n cael eu hadrodd gan un astudiaeth yn unig.
- Dim ond chwe ffynhonnell dystiolaeth a ganfuwyd, ac roedd pedwar ohonynt yn cynnwys gwerthusiadau o ymyriadau sy'n berthnasol i'r pwnc.
- Roedd y ffynonellau dystiolaeth a oedd wedi'u cynnwys yn canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar ymyriadau sydd â'r nod o wella canlyniadau iechyd meddwl neu ganlyniadau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflogaeth.
- Ni chafodd rhai o boblogaethau'r astudiaethau, er eu bod yn ddi-waith ac o oedran gweithio, eu disgrifio'n benodol fel rhai sydd wedi cael eu heffeithio (neu mewn perygl o gael eu heffeithio) gan ddigwyddiad diweithdra torfol.
- Nododd astudiaeth ansoddol yn y DU a oedd yn asesu effaith ymyrraeth iechyd meddwl yn seiliedig ar bêl-droed a sefydlwyd mewn ymateb i ddiswyddiad torfol gweithwyr dur yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, amrywiaeth o fanteision defnyddio diwylliant pêl-droed fel mecanwaith ar gyfer ymyriadau a gynlluniwyd i adeiladu gwytnwch iechyd meddwl mewn gweithwyr sydd wedi'u diswyddo.
- Mae astudiaeth yn Awstralia yn gwerthuso'r broses o weithredu cronfa polisi llywodraeth ffederal gyda'r nod o gynorthwyo gweithwyr dur wedi'u diswyddo i adennill cyflogaeth, adroddwyd bod hyd at hanner wedi'u cyflogi 18 mis ar ôl cael eu diswyddo.
- Mae dystiolaeth o un adolygiad systematig yn awgrymu y gallai hyfforddiant sgiliau swyddi dwys tymor byr (ymyriadau 'clwb swyddi') fod yn effeithiol wrth leihau symptomau iselder hyd at ddwy flynedd ar ôl yr ymyrraeth mewn pobl ddi-waith, yn enwedig y rhai sydd â risg uchel o iselder.
- Dangosodd ymyriadau therapi ymddygiadol gwybyddol dystiolaeth gymysg o effeithiolrwydd ar iselder.
- Roedd y dystiolaeth oedd ar gael i gefnogi'r defnydd o gyngor dros y ffôn ar ddyledion, ysgrifennu mynegiannol, delweddaeth dan arweiniad, a

hyfforddiant cymhwysedd emosiynol ar gyfer gwella canlyniadau iechyd meddwl yn gyfyngedig.

- Gall ymyriadau hunan-gadarnhau byr, seicolegol ar sail gwerthoedd fod yn effeithiol ar gyfer gwella canlyniadau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflogaeth – fel llwyddiant ailgyflogaeth, amser sydd ei angen i ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth newydd, a nifer y cynigion am swyddi a dderbyniwyd – mewn unigolion sy'n ddi-waith ers cyfnod maith neu ers yn ddiweddar.
- Adroddodd dau adolygiad naratif brofiadau cenedlaethol a rhyngwladol o bolisiau a strategaethau gyda'r nod o gynorthwyo gweithwyr sydd wedi'u dadleoli, a rhoddodd argymhellion ar gyfer datblygu rhaglenni llwyddiannus mewn ymateb i ddigwyddiadau pontio'r diwydiant.

Canfyddiadau

Roedd chwe ffynhonnell o dystiolaeth yn gymwys i'w cynnwys yn yr adolygiad cwrpasu ystwyth hwn - tair astudiaeth sylfaenol a thair astudiaeth eilaidd. O'r tair astudiaeth eilaidd, roedd un yn adolygiad systematig tra bod y ddwy arall yn adolygiadau llenyddiaeth. Roedd y tair astudiaeth sylfaenol a nodwyd yn cynnwys un hap-dreial dan reolaeth (RCT), un astudiaeth ansoddol, ac un astudiaeth achos yn defnyddio dull hydredol a dulliau cymysg yn ei ddadansoddiadau.

Canolbwyntiodd dwy astudiaeth sylfaenol ar ymyriadau a gafodd eu cynllunio a'u gweithredu'n benodol mewn ymateb i ddigwyddiadau diweithdra torfol. Cynhaliwyd astudiaeth Dixon et al (2019) yn y DU ac roedd yn gwerthuso effaith ymyrraeth iechyd meddwl sy'n seiliedig ar bêl-droed. Cynhaliwyd astudiaeth O'Brien a Burrows (2019) yn Awstralia ac roedd yn asesu effaith polisiau llywodraeth ffederal gyda'r nod o helpu gweithwyr wedi'u diswyddo i gael eu hailgyflogi. Dyma oedd y mesurau canlyniad: gwydnwch iechyd meddwl, creu cyflogaeth, a statws cyflogaeth ar ôl colli swydd.

Roedd dwy astudiaeth arall (un adolygiad systematig ac un astudiaeth sylfaenol) yn canolbwyntio ar ymyriadau gyda'r nod o leihau effaith diweithdra cyffredinol. Roedd yr adolygiad systematig (Moore et al 2017), yn canolbwyntio ar ymyriadau i leihau effaith diweithdra a chaledi economaidd ar iechyd meddwl yn y boblogaeth gyffredinol, ac roedd yn cynnwys 11 o hap-dreialon dan reolaeth o ymyriadau iechyd cyhoeddus neu o ddarparu gwasanaethau gyda'r nod o liniaru'r effeithiau hyn. Gwerthusodd yr astudiaeth sylfaenol (Pfrombeck et al 2023) ymyriad hunan-gadarnhau byr sy'n seiliedig ar werthoedd gyda'r nod o gynyddu'r siawns o ailgyflogaeth ar ôl colli swydd ac yn ystod diweithdra. Cynhaliwyd yr astudiaeth hon ar hyd a lled sawl gwlad ym mhob cwr o'r byd. Dyma oedd y mesurau canlyniad: llwyddiant ailgyflogaeth, nifer y cynigion swyddi, ac amser sydd ei angen i ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth newydd.

Roedd y ddwy yn cynnwys adolygiadau llenyddiaeth (Jobs Queensland 2018 a Phillimore et al 2019) yn canolbwyntio ar effeithiau pontio diwydiant ar weithwyr sydd wedi'u dadleoli a strategaethau i gefnogi'r gweithwyr hyn. Roedd y ddau

adolygiad llenyddiaeth yn benodol i gyd-destun Awstralia ond nid oeddent yn adrodd gwerthusiadau o ymyriadau penodol. Yn hytrach, doedd y ddwy astudiaeth yn disgrifio rhaglenni a gyflwynwyd yn flaenorol i gefnogi gweithwyr sydd wedi'u dadleoli, yn ogystal ag elfennau allweddol rhaglenni llwyddiannus.

Mae crynodeb manwl o'r ffynonellau tystiolaeth sydd wedi'u cynnwys i'w gweld yn Nhablau 2 a 3.

Ymyriadau a gynlluniwyd ac a weithredwyd mewn ymateb i ddigwyddiad diweithdra torfol

Ymyriadau sydd â'r nod o wella canlyniadau sy'n gysylltiedig ag iechyd meddwl

Ymyrraeth iechyd meddwl yn seiliedig ar bêl-droed

Roedd yr astudiaeth ansoddol gan Dixon et al (2019) yn asesu effaith ymyrraeth iechyd meddwl yn seiliedig ar bêl-droed (Redcar and Cleveland Boot Room), a sefydlwyd mewn ymateb i ddiswyddo torfol gweithwyr dur yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, gyda'r nod o feithrin gwytnwch iechyd meddwl. Hwyluswyd y Boot Room gan Hwrwyddwr Iechyd Cymunedol, ac fe'i sefydlwyd heb unrhyw sylfeini strwythurol penodol, dim ond fel lle i gwrdd yn enw pêl-droed. **Trwy drafodaethau rhyngweithiol gydag aelodau'r Boot Room, dangosodd yr astudiaeth hon y canlynol: (a) bod iaith pêl-droed a hunaniaeth a rennir yn bwysig ar gyfer cychwyn a chynnal ymgysylltu yn y Boot Room; (b) bod cymorth gan gymheiriaid a mentora ynghyd â gweithgareddau a arweinir gan aelodau yn gynhwysion gweithredol y Boot Room; a (c) bod y Boot Room yn gyfrwng effeithiol ar gyfer adeiladu gwytnwch iechyd meddwl.** Yn ogystal, er nad oedd cyflogaeth yn ganolbwynt allweddol y Boot Room, mae'n debyg bod 15 aelod wedi dod o hyd i gyflogaeth yn ystod y rhaglen. Roedd yr aelodau yn credu'n gryf bod hybu hyder (trwy weithgareddau a drefnwyd yn y Boot Room) yn cyfrannu'n fawr at y llwyddiannau hyn sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflogaeth.

Ymyriadau sydd â'r nod o wella canlyniadau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflogaeth

Polisiau llywodraeth ffederal

Fe wnaeth O'Brien a Burrows (2019) werthuso effeithiolrwydd pecyn \$ 40 miliwn llywodraeth ffederal gyda'r nod o greu cyfleoedd swyddi cynaliadwy a helpu gweithwyr dur wedi'u diswyddo i gael ailgyflogaeth yn dilyn digwyddiad diweithdra torfol. Defnyddiodd yr astudiaeth achos hon ddull hydredol a dulliau cymysg i ddadansoddi effeithiolrwydd y polisi. **Dangosodd y canlyniadau fod 40% o'r 92 o ymatebwyr a holwyd wedi eu cyflogi chwe mis ar ôl colli swydd, ond roedd cyfraddau diweithdra yn cynyddu gydag oedran hŷn. Cynyddodd cyfraddau cyflogaeth i 51% 18 mis ar ôl colli swydd, gyda gwelliannau mewn cyfraddau diweithdra gan y grwpiau oedran hŷn.**

Ymyriadau'n ymwneud â diweithdra cyffredinol yn fras

Ymyriadau sydd â'r nod o wella canlyniadau sy'n gysylltiedig ag iechyd meddwl

Gwerthusodd yr adolygiad systematig gan Moore et al (2017) effeithiolrwydd ymyriadau gyda'r nod o leihau effeithiau diweithdra a chaledi economaidd ar iechyd meddwl yn y boblogaeth gyffredinol. Adroddwyd bod yr holl gyfranogwyr yn yr 11 o astudiaethau sylfaenol a oedd wedi'u cynnwys yn ddiwaith, gyda chyfnodau diweithdra cymedrig yn amrywio o 2.3 i 33 mis. Ni ddisgrifiwyd cyfranogwyr yr astudiaethau yn benodol fel rhai sydd wedi cael eu heffeithio (neu mewn perygl o gael eu heffeithio) gan ddigwyddiad diweithdra torfol. Dyfarnwyd bod pob astudiaeth a oedd wedi'i chynnwys mewn risg uchel o ragfarn. Dangosodd tystiolaeth o bum treial fod **ymyriadau hyfforddiant sgiliau swyddi dwys byr (1 i 2 wythnos) ar gyfer pobl ddi-waith yn effeithiol ar gyfer lleihau symptomau iselder hyd at 2 flynedd ar ôl ymyrraeth; gydag effeithiau cryfaf ymhlith y rhai sydd mewn mwy o berygl o iselder ($p = 0.01$).** Mewn cyfranogwyr risg uchel cafodd sgorau iselder eu lleihau ar 6 wythnos (MD: -0.26 , 95% CI -0.48 i -0.04 ; $p = 0.01$), 4 mis (MD: -0.36 , 95% CI -0.59 i -0.13 ; $p = 0.001$) a 28 mis (MD: -0.25 , 95% CI -0.50 i -0.0 ; $p = 0.01$). Dangosodd ymyriadau therapi ymddygiadol gwybyddol (CBT) dystiolaeth gymysg o effeithiolrwydd ar iselder (dau dreial). Roed effeithiolrwydd pedwar ymyrraeth arall (Cyngor dros y ffôn ar ddyledion; ysgrifennu mynegiannol; delweddaeth dan arweiniad; a hyfforddiant cymhwysedd emosiynol) a aseswyd mewn un hap-dreial dan reolaeth yr un, yn dweud bod y dystiolaeth o fuddion yn gyfyngedig.

Ymyriadau sydd â'r nod o wella canlyniadau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflogaeth

Ymyriadau seicolegol

Archwiliodd un hap-dreial dan reolaeth a oedd yn cynnwys dau dreial (Pfrombeck et al 2023) a yw ymyrraeth hunan-gadarnhau byr, seicolegol ar sail gwerthoedd yn effeithiol o ran gwella llwyddiant unigolion sy'n ddi-waith yn barhaus ac yn ddiweddar wrth chwilio am swyddi. Dangosodd y canlyniadau fod **defnyddio ymyrraeth hunan-gadarnhau 15 munud wedi cynyddu canlyniadau allweddol sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflogaeth ar ôl pedair wythnos gan gynnwys y tebygolrwydd o ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth newydd [Astudiaeth 1 ($b = 0.872$, $P = 0.035$, OR = 2.392); Astudiaeth 2 ($b = 1.241$, $P = 0.012$, OR = 3.461)], yr amser sydd ei angen i ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth newydd [$F(1,322) = 7.27$, $P = 0.007$], a nifer y cynigion swydd a dderbyniwyd [(Astudiaeth 1: $b = 0.777$, $P = 0.002$, OR = 2.175; Astudiaeth 2: $b = 0.400$, $P = 0.024$, OR = 1.492)].** Roedd yr ymyrraeth yr un mor effeithiol i unigolion o dan 50 oed a thros 50 oed, ac ar gyfer unigolion sy'n ddi-waith yn barhaus neu'n ddiweddar.

Astudiaethau ychwanegol o ddiddordeb posibl

Disgrifiodd yr adolygiad llenyddiaeth gan Jobs Queensland (2018) effaith pontio diwydiant ar y gweithlu, y cyflenwad sgiliau a'r galw gan ganolbwyntio ar nodi a diffinio 'arferion gorau'. Awgrymodd y papur hwn y dylid ystyried wyth ffactor wrth ddatblygu ymateb unigol, wedi'i deilwra i ddigwyddiad pontio'r diwydiant:

1. Amser

2. Cynllunio rhagddyfalus
3. Llywodraethu a lledaenu gwybodaeth
4. Canolbwyntio ar yr ardal yr effeithiwyd arni
5. Cyfalaf dynol
6. Arallgyfeirio economaidd
7. Cydgysylltu lleol a rheoli achosion
8. Gwerthusiad

Yn yr un modd, roedd yr adolygiad llenyddiaeth gan Phillimore et al (2019) yn adrodd ar brofiad cenedlaethol a rhyngwladol mewn polisïau a mentrau gyda'r nod o gynorthwyo gweithwyr sydd wedi'u dadleoli, yng nghyd-destun newid technolegol cyflym, ac edrychodd ar sut roedd Awstralia yn cymharu â gweddill y byd wrth ymdrin â'r mater o ddadleoli gweithwyr. Yn ogystal â'r wyth ffactor y dylid eu hystyried wrth ddatblygu ymateb unigol, wedi'i deilwra i ddigwyddiad pontio'r diwydiant (gweler uchod), awgrymodd yr adolygiad hwn bedwar maen prawf arall sy'n hanfodol i lwyddiant:

1. Pwyllgorau/cyrff teirochrog i gynllunio a goruchwyllo mentrau
2. Cyfuno diswyddiadau
3. Gwasanaethau pwrpasol ar gyfer rheoli lles gweithwyr yr effeithir arnynt
4. Rheoleiddio darparwyr gwasanaethau swyddi yn llymach

Opsiynau ar gyfer gwaith pellach

Mae'n bosibl na fydd ein chwiliadau wedi nodi'r holl dystiolaeth (eilaidd a sylfaenol) sy'n berthnasol i'r pwnc hwn. Fodd bynnag, yn seiliedig ar brinder astudiaethau sylfaenol cyhoeddus a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn, prin yw'r cyfle i'r Gwasanaeth Tystiolaeth wneud rhagor o waith ar y pwnc hwn.

Dulliau

Mae Atodiad A (atodiad technegol) yn darparu amlinelliad o'r sail resymegol a'r dulliau cyffredinol a ddefnyddir i ddatblygu cwmpasau ystwyth. Mae'r fethodoleg ganlynol yn amlinellu'r dull a wnaed a ddefnyddiwyd ar gyfer yr adroddiad cwmpasu ystwyth hwn.

Gan fod hwn yn bwnc eang, roedd y cwmpasu ystwyth hwn wedi'i gyfyngu i gynnwys dim ond adolygiadau a gynhyrchwyd gan ddefnyddio dulliau penodol ac atgynhyrchadwy o chwilio systematig, arfarniad beirniadol o ansawdd a synthesis y llenyddiaeth sylfaenol ar y pwnc. Mae hon yn ffordd dderbyniol o asesu'r rhan fwyaf o'r sylfaen dystiolaeth yn gyflym, ac er nad yw'n bwriadu nodi pob cyhoeddiad ar bwnc, byddai'n golygu y gellir cynhyrchu trosolwg. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd chwiliad cwmpasu cychwynol o'r llenyddiaeth yn nodi unrhyw dystiolaeth eilaidd sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r pwnc ac felly penderfynwyd canolbwytio ar nodi'r holl dystiolaeth a oedd ar gael ar ddigwyddiadau diweithdra torfol.

Ffynonellau data: Edrychwyd ar ddeunaw ffynhonnell dystiolaeth ddibynadwy sy'n cadw at egwyddorion cadarn adolygu systematig¹. Edrychwyd drwy waith Medline, ysgolhaig Google, a Scopus am dystiolaeth a gyhoeddwyd gan ddefnyddio termau chwilio a strategaethau a gynlluniwyd yn benodol ar gyfer pob ffynhonnell ddata. Cynhaliwyd chwiliadau gan ddefnyddio cyfuniad o'r termau canlynol:

- “Gweithwyr sydd wedi'u lleihau, wedi'u diswyddo neu wedi'u dadleoli”
- “Diweithdra neu ddiswyddo torfol neu gau ar raddfa fawr”
- “Diwydiant neu weithgynhyrchu neu ddiwydiant dur neu gyflogwr mawr”

Mae rhestr lawn o'r adnoddau a chwiliwyd wedi'u cynnwys yn atodiad B (atodiad chwilio).

Detholiad o astudiaethau: Aseswyd astudiaethau sylfaenol ac eilaidd i'w cynnwys. Fe wnaeth dau adolygydd sgrinio'r astudiaethau'n annibynnol am berthnasedd ar lefel teitl, ar lefel crynodeb ac ar lefel testun llawn yn erbyn y meini prawf cynhwysiant a amlinellir yn nhabl 1.

Echdynnu data: Lle y bo'n bosibl, echdynnwyd data yn adrodd nodweddion perthnasol o'r adolygiadau a oedd wedi'u cynnwys i dabl echdynnu data (tabl 2). Gwiriodd ail adolygydd y data a echdynnwyd. Datryswyd anghytundebau ar unrhyw gam trwy drafod gyda thrydydd adolygydd.

Asesiad ansawdd: Cafodd yr holl astudiaethau sydd wedi'u cynnwys eu harfarnu'n feirniadol am eu hansawdd. Aeth un adolygydd ati i werthuso'n feirniadol yr holl astudiaethau a oedd wedi'u cynnwys gan ddefnyddio rhestrau gwirio ar gyfer yr

¹ Dilyn egwyddorion adolygu craidd systematig: strategaeth chwilio gynhwysfawr a datganedig, dewis ffynonellau yn seiliedig ar feini prawf gwrthrychol, asesu'r risg o duedd o ffynonellau sylfaenol a/neu mae'n fethodoleg a ddatblygwyd gan gorff arbenigol e.e. NICE. Am restr lawn o ffynonellau a chwiliwyd, cyfeiriwch at adran Ffynonellau a chwiliwyd o'r adroddiad.

astudiaeth wedi'u cynllunio'n briodol gan JBI a CASP. Gwiriodd ail adolygydd yr astudiaethau a werthuswyd am gysondeb.

Tabl 1: Meini Prawf Cynhwysiant	
Cwestiwn yr adolygiad	
Pa ymyriadau sy'n effeithiol ar gyfer lliniaru effeithiau digwyddiadau diweithdra torfol?	
Cyfranogwyr	Poblogaethau oedran gweithio sydd wedi cael eu diswyddo neu sydd mewn perygl o ddigwyddiad diweithdra torfol, ac sy'n byw yng ngwledydd y Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd (OECD) (cyn 1974)
Ymyrraeth	Ymyriadau i liniaru effeithiau digwyddiad diweithdra torfol ar unigolion, teuluoedd a chymunedau.
Cymhariaeth	Amherthnasol
Canlyniadau	Unrhyw fesurau hunangofnodedig neu wrthrychol o iechyd corfforol a meddyliol neu iechyd meddwl, neu ymddygiadau iechyd. Unrhyw effeithiau tymor byr neu hirdymor ar unigolion, teuluoedd neu'r gymuned.
Ystyriaethau Eraill yr Astudiaeth	
Lleoliad – y cyfan Cynllun yr astudiaeth – tystiolaeth sylfaenol ac eilaidd Iaith cyhoeddi – Saesneg Terfyn dyddiad – ers 2016 Gwledydd – OECD (cyn 1974)	

Cyfeiriadau

Davies, A., Homolova, L., Grey, C. N., & Bellis, M. A. (2017). Mass Unemployment Events (MUEs): Prevention and Response from a Public Health Perspective. Public Health Wales.

Dixon, K., Belshaw, D., Johnson, P., & Flynn, D. (2019). Using football cultures as a vehicle to improve mental health in men: The case of the Redcar and Cleveland boot room. *Sport in Society*, 22(7), 1258-1274.

Jobs Queensland. (2018). Supporting workforces during industry transition: Key elements for success. Literature review. State of Queensland.

Moore, T. H. M., Kapur, N., Hawton, K., Richards, A., Metcalfe, C., & Gunnell, D. (2017). Interventions to reduce the impact of unemployment and economic hardship on mental health in the general population: a systematic review. *Psychological medicine*, 47(6), 1062-1084.

O'Brien, M., & Burrows, S. (2019). Assessing the effectiveness of regional policy responses to mass redundancies: the case of the Illawarra region, Australia. *Economic Papers: A journal of applied economics and policy*, 38(2), 144-155.

Pfrombeck, J., Galinsky, A. D., Nagy, N., North, M. S., Brockner, J., & Grote, G. (2023). Self-affirmation increases reemployment success for the unemployed. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 120(37), e2301532120.

Phillimore, J., Fitzgerald, S., & Galantino, M. (2019). Assisting workers displaced by technological and structural change. School of Management Curtin University.

Atodiad A: Dogfen dechnegol

MAE ADOLYGIADAU CWMPASU ystwyth yn drosolygon systematig a chyflym o'r dystiolaeth ar bwnc sy'n cael eu gyrru gan y rhanddeiliaid. Maent yn darparu trosolwg tryloyw a dibynadwy o'r dirwedd dystiolaeth ac maent yn ddefnyddiol er mwyn:

- sefydlu pa lenyddiaeth sy'n bodoli
- helpu i fireinio cwestiwn eang
- nodi bylchau yn y dystiolaeth
- llywio gwaith pellach gan y rhanddeiliaid.

Mae'r adolygiadau cwmpasau'n defnyddio proses o hyd at dri cham, gan ddibynnu ar ba dystiolaeth sydd ar gael ar gyfer y pwnc. Mae symud ymlaen o'r naill gam i'r llall yn cael ei drafod a'i gytuno gyda'r rhanddeiliaid.

1. Y cam cyntaf yw tynnu ar dystiolaeth adolygiadau systematig bresennol sydd wedi'u nodi mewn ffynonellau dibynadwy² (ffynonellau tystiolaeth eilaidd sy'n defnyddio methodolegau cadarn) lle mae hyn yn bodoli. Nid yw'r Gwasanaeth Tystiolaeth yn cynnal gwerthusiad beirniadol o'r adolygiadau hyn.
2. Os nad oes fawr ddim tystiolaeth, os o gwbl, wedi'i nodi ar hyn o bryd, cynhelir chwiliad syml iawn yn Medline gan ddefnyddio allweddeiriau yn unig i ganfod budd cynnal chwiliadau pellach mewn ystod ehangach o gronfeydd data. Bydd crynodeb o ganlyniadau'r chwiliad (h.y., nifer, cynllun yr astudiaeth, perthnasedd ac ati) yn cael ei ddarparu yn y cwmpas ystwyth i helpu i hysbysu rhanddeiliaid.
3. Lle nad oes fawr ddim tystiolaeth eilaidd y gellir ymddiried ynnddi yn bodoli, os o gwbl, ac os yw'r chwiliad Medline a gynhaliwyd yng ngham 2 yn nodi ei fod o fudd, gellir ymestyn y cwmpas, ar gais y rhanddeiliad, i gynnwys chwiliad am adolygiadau systematig neu lenyddiaeth sylfaenol yn Google Scholar, Scopus neu Medline, fel y bo'n briodol. Yn y cam hwn ac unrhyw gam dilynol, byddai angen asesu ansawdd y dystiolaeth a nodwyd.
4. Nid yw astudiaethau sylfaenol yn cael eu cynnwys fel arfer, oni bai bod ychydig neu ddim adolygiadau systematig yn cael eu nodi yng ngham rhagarweiniol cam 1, neu fod rhanddeiliaid yn gofyn am hynny yn dilyn gwaith cynharach y maent wedi'i wneud.

Ystyriaethau

- Nid yw'r cwmpas yn ceisio nodi'r holl dystiolaeth ar bwnc penodol.
- Ni fydd pob canlyniad a nodir yn y llenyddiaeth o reidrydd yn cael ei
- gynnwys yn yr adroddiad cwmpasu hwn am nifer o resymau, gan gynnwys:
 - Mae'r canlyniadau a gynhwysir yn y cwmpas wedi'u cyfyngu i'r rhai sy'n

² Darperir y ffynonellau ar restr y Gwasanaeth Tystiolaeth o'r adnoddau tystiolaeth eilaidd y gellir ymddiried ynnddynt yn Nhabl 1

- berthnasol i gwestiwn gwreiddiol y rhanddeiliaid.
- Mae'n bosibl nad yw canlyniadau wedi'u hadrodd yn y ffynonellau eilaidd, er y gallen nhw fodoli yn y llenyddiaeth sylfaenol. Gan hynny, fydd y canlyniadau hyn ddim yn cael eu cynnwys yn yr adroddiad cwmpasu.
- Nid yw canfyddiadau mewn adolygiadau sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn cael eu hasesu i weld a oes modd eu cyffredinoli yn y cyd-destun Cymreig. [Byddai hynny'n broses gymhleth gan fod tystiolaeth eilaidd yn debygol o gynnwys astudiaethau o nifer o wledydd.] Byddai angen i'r rhanddeiliaid ystyried hyn os ydyn nhw'n defnyddio tystiolaeth eilaidd i lywio polisi ac arferion. Gellid gofyn am waith ychwanegol os oes ei angen.
- Mae'r cwmpas yn crynhoi canfyddiadau a chasgliadau awduron y ffynonellau. Os oes elfen benodol o'r adroddiad o ddiddordeb arbennig, mae'n ddoeth darllen y ffynhonnell/ffynonellau y mae'n tarddu ohonyn nhw yn fanylach, gan y bydd hyn yn rhoi mwy o gyd-destun. Gellir gwneud gwaith pellach ar feysydd penodol os oes ei angen.
- Darperir hyperddolenni i'r dystiolaeth sydd wedi'i chynnwys yn y tabl crynhoi data. Mewn llawer o achosion, mae'r dystiolaeth honno ar gael am ddim. Os nad yw, gall gwasanaeth Gwybodaeth a Llyfrgell eich Ymddiriedolaeth helpu. [Gwasanaeth Llyfrgell GIG Cymru](#)

Dulliau

Mae pob adolygiad cwmpasu ystwyth yn dilyn methodoleg a strwythur eang, gydag amrywiadau bach yn unig yn ôl y cwestiwn a'r sylfaen dystiolaeth a nodwyd. Trwy drafod gyda'r rhanddeiliaid, datblygir cwestiwn ymchwil a meini prawf cynnwys/hepgor gan ddefnyddio fformat PICO/PECO (poblogaeth, ymyriad/amlygiad, cymharydd, canlyniad). **Sylwch: gofynnir i'r rhanddeiliaid nodi tystiolaeth/gwybodaeth y maen nhw eisoes wedi'u nodi.**

Fel y nodwyd uchod, mae'r fethodoleg a ddefnyddir wedi'i chynllunio i ddarparu gwybodaeth gyflym i'r rhanddeiliaid. Yn y cam cyntaf, mae cyfyngu'r chwiliad i ffynonellau o'r rhestr adnoddau tystiolaeth eilaidd yr ymddiriedir ynddynt yn lleihau'r amser a gymerir o ran cwmpas y chwiliad a thrwy hepgor yr angen am werthusiad beirniadol.

Mae'r strategaeth chwilio a ddatblygwyd wedi'i seilio ar y meini prawf cynnwys ac yn defnyddio geiriau allweddol. Mae'r cwmpas wedi'i gyfyngu i gynnwys tystiolaeth Saesneg yn unig a gellir gosod terfynau o ran y dyddiad cyhoeddi pan fydd canlyniadau'r chwiliad yn rhy fawr i'w rheoli mewn cyfnod byr, neu pan fo'r rhanddeiliad yn gofyn i waith gael ei gwblhau o fewn amserlen benodol. Yn ychwanegol, gall y gwledydd a gynhwysir gael eu cyfyngu yng ngham tri, yn enwedig lle mae cyffredinoli i gyddestun Cymru yn bryder arbennig.

Cedwir yr holl ganlyniadau chwilio a sgrinio ar gyfer adolygiadau systematig perthnasol mewn llyfrgell EndNote neu mewn system addas ar gyfer rheoli cyfeiriadau. Mae'r penderfyniad i gynnwys deunyddiau ar lefel y teitl a'r crynodeb yn

cael ei bwysu a'i fesur gan ddau adolygydd sy'n sgrinio'n annibynnol y 10% i 20% cyntaf o'r adolygiadau systematig ar gyfer perthnasedd, gyda'r gweddill yn cael eu sgrinio gan un adolygydd. Mae penderfyniadau sgrinio'r testun llawn yn cael eu gwneud gan ddau adolygydd. Mae data ar nodweddion yr astudiaethau a'r canfyddiadau sy'n berthnasol i'r cwestiwn yn cael eu tynnu gan un adolygydd a'u gwirio gan ail adolygydd. Wedyn mae'r dystiolaeth yn cael ei chrynhai ar ffurf naratif i ateb cwestiynau'r rhanddeiliaid. Mae adroddiad yn cael ei gyflwyno ar fylchau yn y dystiolaeth yn y llenyddiaeth eilaidd.

Os na nodir unrhyw dystiolaeth, neu nodir tystiolaeth gyfyngedig, o'r rhestr o ffynonellau eilaidd y gellir ymddiried ynddynt, cynhelir chwiliad byr yn Medline gan ddefnyddio chwiliadau gydag allweddeiriau sylfaenol i ganfod budd cynnal chwiliadau pellach mewn ystod ehangach o gronfeydd data. Bydd crynodeb o'r canlyniadau chwilio (h.y. nifer, cynllun yr astudiaeth, perthnasedd ac ati) yn cael ei ddarparu yn y cwmpas ystwyth.

Canfyddiadau

Mae'r adroddiad cwmpasu ystwyth yn cynnwys crynodeb naratif a thabl data. Mae'r crynodeb naratif yn drosolwg bras o'r dystiolaeth a nodwyd, gyda ffocws penodol ar elfennau a amlygwyd fel rhai pwysig gan y rhanddeiliaid. Mae'r tablau data yn cynnwys y cyfeiriad (gyda hyperddolen), gwybodaeth am nodweddion a chanfyddiadau'r astudiaeth. Bydd yr wybodaeth yn y tablau data yn amrywio yn ôl y cwestiwn, y mathau o astudiaethau sydd wedi'u cynnwys a gofynion y rhanddeiliaid. Mae'r tabl hefyd yn cynnwys adran sylwadau sy'n amlygu unrhyw elfennau o ddiddordeb arbennig i'r rhanddeiliaid ynghyd ag unrhyw gyfyngiadau y dylid eu hystyried.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cloi gydag adran 'opsiynau ar gyfer gwaith pellach'. Mae'r awgrymiadau hyn wedi'u seilio ar y dystiolaeth a nodwyd ac yn rhoi sail resymegol benodol lle argymhellir gwaith pellach i adolygu'r dystiolaeth. Bydd yr wybodaeth hon yn cael ei llywio gan y chwiliad byr ychwanegol a gynhaliwyd yn Medline i helpu i asesu faint o wybodaeth ychwanegol sydd, a manteision tebygol cynnal gwaith ychwanegol. Bydd y canfyddiadau hyn yn cael eu darparu i randdeiliaid er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gallu gwneud penderfyniad gwybodus ynghylch beth i'w wneud nesaf.

Atodiad B: Atodiad Chwiliadau

Tabl 1: Yr adnoddau a chwiliwyd	
<p>Cochrane database of systematic reviews - https://www.cochranelibrary.com/cdsr/reviews</p> <p><i>Systematic reviews on health care interventions, diagnostics and public health interventions.</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>0 results</p>
<p>NICE – https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance</p> <p><i>Guidelines of health care and public health topics. Note: you should be looking for systematic evidence reviews that may underpin guidance on your topic, not the guidance itself. Not all recommendations are based on evidence reviews.</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>0 results</p>
<p>Joanna Briggs Institute - https://journals.lww.com/jbisrir/pages/advancedsearch.aspx</p> <p><i>This organisation’s journal, JBI Evidence Synthesis includes systematic and scoping reviews of both quantitative and qualitative evidence on healthcare and public health topics.</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>1 result</p>
<p>Prospero – https://www.crd.york.ac.uk/prospero/</p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>0 results</p>
<p>National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Public Health Research – https://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/phr/about-the-phr-journal.htm</p> <p><i>Some reports in this journal are systematic reviews of interventions to improve public health.</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>0 results</p>
<p>The Evidence for Policy and Practice Information and Co-ordinating Centre (EPPI-Centre) – http://eppi.ioe.ac.uk/cms/</p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>0 results</p>
<p>Campbell Collaboration systematic reviews - https://www.campbellcollaboration.org/better-evidence.html</p> <p><i>Systematic reviews of the effects of social interventions in Crime & Justice, Education, International Development, and Social Welfare.</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>1 result</p>
<p>What Works Centre for Wellbeing – https://whatworkswellbeing.org/about-us/</p> <p><i>Systematic reviews of the impacts of policies and projects on wellbeing.</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>0 results</p>
<p>What Works Clearinghouse (USA) – https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/</p> <p><i>Systematic reviews on what works in education.</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>0 results</p>
<p>Early Intervention Foundation (EIF) – https://www.eif.org.uk/about</p>	<p>Date of search: 16/02/2024</p> <p>0 results</p>

<i>Systematic reviews about early interventions for tackling the root causes of social problems for children and young people.</i>	
What Works Centre for Local Economic Growth – https://whatworksgrowth.org/about-us/ <i>Systematic reviews on policies for local economic growth.</i>	Date of search: 16/02/2024 0 results
Health Technology Wales – https://healthtechnology.wales/ <i>Reports and guidance on use of medical devices, surgical procedures, psychological therapies, tele-monitoring or rehabilitation.</i>	Date of search: 16/02/2024 0 results
Health Technology Assessments (Ireland) – https://www.hiqa.ie/areas-work/health-technology-assessment <i>Health technology assessments on the clinical and cost-effectiveness of drugs, equipment, diagnostic techniques and public health activities.</i>	Date of search: 16/02/2024 0 results
National Institute for Health Research Health (NIHR) Technology Assessment (HTA) Journal – https://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hta/about-the-hta-journal.htm <i>Some reports in this journal are systematic reviews of interventions to, prevent and treat disease and improve rehabilitation and long-term care.</i>	Date of search: 16/02/2024 0 results
Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ) Search Evidence-Based Reports Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (ahrq.gov) <i>Effectiveness and comparative effectiveness reviews of health care interventions.</i>	Date of search: 16/02/2024 0 results
Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies (CADTH) – https://www.cadth.ca/evidence-bundles-view <i>Rapid response systematic reviews and meta-analyses of health technologies, including drugs and diagnostic tests, medical, dental and surgical devices and procedures.</i>	Date of search: 16/02/2024 0 results
Evidence Synthesis Program Reports (va.gov) – https://www.hsrdr.research.va.gov/publications/esp/reports.cfm <i>Evidence syntheses of health care interventions of particular relevance to veterans.</i>	Date of search: 16/02/2024 0 results
Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (SIGN) clinical guidelines – https://www.sign.ac.uk/our-guidelines/ <i>Clinical practice guidelines. Note: you should be looking for systematic evidence reviews that may underpin guidance on your topic, not the guidance itself. Not all guidance is based on evidence reviews</i>	Date of search: 16/02/2024 0 results
Google Scholar – https://scholar.google.com/ <i>Search using your keywords AND “systematic review”</i>	Date of search: 23/02/2024 196 results
Epistemonikos - https://www.epistemonikos.org/	Date of search: 16/02/2024

<p><i>Search using keywords and select “systematic reviews” in the filter By Category menu in the results</i></p>	<p>0 results</p>
<p>Scopus - https://www.scopus.com/search/form.uri?zone=TopNavBar&origin=searchbasic&display=basic#basic</p> <p><i>Suitable for Social Science related topics</i> <i>Search using keywords and select “review” in the filter by document type in the results</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 23/02/2024</p> <p>152 results</p>
<p>Medline – https://www.scopus.com/search/form.uri?display=basic#basic</p> <p><i>Search using your keywords AND [Systematic Review]</i> <i>Suitable for clinical/health related topics</i></p>	<p>Date of search: 23/02/2024</p> <p>185 results</p>

Atodiad C: Echdynnu data

Tabl 2: Echdynnu data o'r astudiaethau eilaidd sydd wedi'u cynnwys (yn nhrefn yr wyddor)			
Cyfeiriad	Nod/Cwestiwn	Crynodeb	Sylwadau
Jobs Queensland. (2018). Supporting workforces during industry transition: Key elements for success. Literature review. (2018). State of Queensland.	To investigate the impact of industry transition on the workforce and skills supply and demand with a focus on identifying and defining 'best practice'	<p>Evidence Type: Literature Review</p> <p>Number of included studies: N/A</p> <p>Included study designs: Grey literature (Australian Bureau of Statistics reports, Census counts, OECD reports, Gov.au reports, EU reports).</p> <p>Recency (search dates): Not reported, however the report was published in 2018.</p> <p>Population: Individuals, communities, and regions affected by industry transition.</p> <p>Intervention type: Industry transition/Structural Adjustment Assistance Programmes</p> <p>Outcome measures: N/A</p> <p>Results:</p> <p><u>Industry transition/structural adjustment assistance programmes:</u></p>	<p>This is a literature review and therefore does not follow systematic reviewing methodology, i.e. searching, inclusion or exclusion criteria, quality appraisal etc. Original research undertaken by National Centre for Vocational Education Research [NCVER].</p> <p>Largest industries in Queensland are manufacturing and retail-</p>

		<p>Labour market programmes focus on individual workers who are displaced by the closure of an organisation or other major economic impact such as that sustained through natural disasters. These programmes provide assistance in the form of support from Australian job service providers; career advice and job preparation assistance (e.g. résumé writing, information about job opportunities, job fairs); and training/re- skilling/recognition of prior learning assistance.</p> <p><u>What works for displaced workers?</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Interventions need to be implemented early as it can take time for workers to make future plans and act on them. •Mechanisms need to be in place to ensure a coordinated approach to the provision of services, particularly by government bodies, occurs. •Helping displaced workers identify and access their skills and training needs is critical, including the completion of recognition of prior learning assessments. <p><u>What works for employers and remaining workers?</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •A focus on reskilling and training remaining workers: the Australia Post example. <p>In 2013 Australia Post launched its 'Post People 1st' initiative. The premise of this programme was to offer more opportunities for career transition for the existing workforce through the provision of training and re-skilling.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •The implementation of short-time working models. <p>Short Term Working strategies allow employers to retain workers during times of economic crisis. It involves an employee working less than full-time but for a co-</p>	<p>manufacturing examples may be generalisable to TATA/ Wales. Steel example, the BHP Steelworks' Pathways Programme, may be applicable.</p> <p>Extracted detail on what works for displaced workers and what factors may increase success of skills training may be most useful.</p>
--	--	---	---

		<p>determined number of hours per week and being paid an agreed proportion of their full-time wage.</p> <p><u>What works for communities or regions?</u> Regional risk analysis to inform strategy development. Regular (3–5 yearly) undertaking of risk assessments by local and state governments is advocated as a way of informing an integrated regional strategy and assessing the adaptive capacity of the region.</p> <p><u>The role of skills training and employment-based initiatives</u> Factors which may increase the effectiveness of skills/job training and retraining programmes in mitigating the effects of industry restructuring on affected workers:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Temporary reduction in regular working hours in periods of downturn provides the opportunity for workers to access skills training • Short training programmes can help facilitate retrenched workers into new jobs, can act as a form of compensation for loss of income and can keep retrenched workers attached to the labour market • The training needs to be relevant to current or anticipated labour market requirements <p>Also, More intensive retraining programs and those provided to retrenched workers soon after their job loss have better outcomes in terms of future wages and employment.</p> <p>Programs need to be tailored to the characteristics and needs of the person, and recognise upfront peoples’ strengths and transferable skills.</p>	
--	--	---	--

		<p>Older workers who have been displaced, for example, are more willing to participate in training when the program has been modified to acknowledge their life and work experience, and provide them with new skills that allow them to be competitive in a changing workplace.</p> <p>Undertaking formally recognised accredited training is far more beneficial for workers as it results in qualifications that are recognised nationally. Employers are more likely to be able to recognise the transferable skills of workers if they have formally recognised qualifications.</p> <p><u>Transferability of skills and enabling mobility between occupations</u> An alternative is to focus on the identification of transferable skills of workers to help them find employment in other areas.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Increasing awareness of transferable skills •Reconfiguring training packages •Improving knowledge of local labour markets 	
Moore et al. (2017). Interventions to reduce the impact of unemployment and economic hardship on mental health in	To systematically review the evidence from randomised controlled trials of interventions given to the general population to reduce the effects of unemployment and economic hardship on mental health.	<p>Evidence Type: Systematic Review</p> <p>Number of included studies: 11 studies from 26 Papers</p> <p>Included study designs: Randomised Controlled Trials (RCTs)</p> <p>Recency (search dates): Searches were conducted on 27 March 2015 and re-run on 16 Jan 2016</p>	This systematic review focuses on working age individuals in the general population, and not necessarily people affected (or at risk of being

<p>the general population: a systematic review. Psychological medicine, 47(6), 1062-1084.</p>		<p>Population: Working age individuals in the general population</p> <p>Intervention type: Interventions given to the general population to reduce the effects of economic hardship on mental health.</p> <p>Outcome measures: Any mental health outcome (e.g., measures of either mental disorder or mental health symptom scales).</p> <p>Results: Eleven RCTs (including 5303 participants) from 26 papers were included in the review. Six studies were from the USA, two from the UK, and one each from Spain, Australia and Finland. Interventions reported included: 'job-club' type interventions for unemployed people to cope with job loss and assist them into new employment (n = 5), cognitive behavioural therapy (CBT) for unemployed people (n = 2), expressive writing (n = 1), guided mental imagery (n =1), emotional competencies training (n = 1), and debt advice for people in debt (n =1). All participants in the included studies were unemployed, with mean durations of unemployment ranging from 2.3 to 33 months. Most studies were assessed as being at high or unclear 'risk of bias'.</p> <p><u>'Job-club' interventions:</u> Five studies, reported in 17 papers assessed the effects of 'job-club' interventions. Four of these compared 'job-club' to written, self-administered job-search</p>	<p>affected) by a mass unemployment event. However, all participants in the included studies were unemployed.</p> <p>Six studies were from the USA, two from the UK, and one each from Spain, Australia and Finland, so findings are likely to be generalisable to Wales</p> <p>Most studies were assessed as at high or unclear 'risk of bias' so the numerical outcomes need to be interpreted with some caution.</p>
---	--	--	---

		<p>materials (JOBS I, JOBS II, Tyohon) and one compared 'job-club' to usual unemployment centre services.</p> <p>The JOBS I intervention delivered job skills training seminars to groups of 16 to 20 people in eight sessions of 3 hours. The JOBS I intervention was modified in JOBS II to focus more on enhancement of personal control, sense of mastery and job-search self-efficacy; sessions were reduced from eight sessions over 2 weeks in JOBS I to daily 4 h sessions provided over 5 days in JOBS II and training of group facilitators was also increased.</p> <p>The 'job club' intervention delivered in JOBS I had no effect on levels of anxiety or depression at 6 weeks or 4 months. A post-hoc subgroup analysis showed that the participants with higher risk of developing depression, benefitted most from the intervention ($p = 0.01$).</p> <p>In high-risk participants depression scores were reduced at 6 weeks [difference in means: -0.26, 95% confidence interval (CI) -0.48 to -0.04; interaction: $F = 6.07$ $p = 0.01$], 4 months (difference in means: -0.36, 95% CI -0.59 to -0.13; interaction: $F = 12.14$ $p = 0.001$) and 28 months (difference in means: -0.25, 95% CI -0.50 to 0.0; interaction: $F = 6.05$ $p = 0.01$) by up to almost 0.5 S.D. on the depression subscale of the Hopkins Symptom Checklist 90 (HSCL-90).</p> <p>Study authors reported a small improvement of depressive symptoms at 2 years for those who received the JOBS II intervention (standardised linear regression coefficient -0.06, $p < 0.05$). As in JOBS I, stronger effects of approximately 0.2 S.D. improvements were seen in participants at high risk of depression (around 40% of the trial participants) (interaction: $F_{1,1331} = 4.10$, $p = 0.043$).</p>	<p>Insufficient data reported in the studies to prepare a meta-analysis for 'job-club' type interventions; the remaining interventions were too heterogeneous in terms of interventions to attempt to pool data, so only narrative synthesis was performed.</p>
--	--	--	---

		<p><u>CBT interventions:</u> Two trials of 195 to 289 participants, assessed the effect of group CBT on long-term unemployed individuals. The intervention content was similar in both trials, including cognitive restructuring, behaviour modification and homework assignments. One trial found that CBT improved mental health (GHQ-30) scores (difference in means: -1.44, 95% CI -3.20 to 0.32, $p < 0.05$) at 7 weeks but found no effect on the proportion of participants meeting thresholds for a psychiatric 'case' (defined as a score >5 on GHQ-30) in the intervention group (21%) compared to the control group (23%) ($p = 0.78$). However, people receiving CBT were more likely to be employed at 7 weeks compared to those in the control group (34% v. 13%, $p = 0.0006$). The second smaller CBT trial showed no effect on employment or the mental health indicators.</p> <p><u>Telephone debt advice:</u> Two studies ($n = 402$) providing telephone debt advice to people who were in debt (recruited from unemployment offices) had no effect on measures of anxiety, or on numerous measures of indebtedness, but only 31% of participants in the intervention group actually received debt advice and 10% of the control (no intervention) group independently sought debt advice.</p> <p><u>Expressive writing:</u> One study ($n=41$) providing unemployed people with opportunities for expressive writing, showed that this intervention had no effect on symptoms of anxiety at 3 months but appeared to improve employment.</p> <p><u>Guided imagery:</u> Two studies involving 76 participants assessed the effects of guided imagery (20 min over six sessions) that allowed participants to finding and obtaining</p>	
--	--	--	--

		<p>employment and also included relaxation techniques compared to control imagery. People who received guided imagery were more likely to be in employment at 7 weeks but there was no effect on depression.</p> <p><u>Emotional competency training</u>: Provision of group emotional competency training (One study, n = 75) for unemployed people compared to no intervention did not present an analysis of the effects of emotional competency training on mental health but calculation of the difference in means and 95% CIs showed no effect on (GHQ-12), nor on symptoms of depression, anxiety or stress.</p>	
<p>Phillimore et al. (2019). Assisting Workers Displaced by Technological and Structural Change. School of Management Curtin University.</p>	<p>This report reports on national and international experience in policies and initiatives aimed at assisting displaced workers, especially in the context of rapid technological change. It also looks at how Australia compares in dealing with the issue of worker displacement</p>	<p>Evidence Type: Narrative/literature review</p> <p>Number of included studies: N/A</p> <p>Included study designs: Grey literature</p> <p>Recency (search dates): Not stated, however the report was published in 2019</p> <p>Population: Displaced workers/workers facing loss of employment due to technology or energy transition.</p> <p>Intervention type: Policies and initiatives aimed at assisting displaced workers</p> <p>Outcome measures: N/A</p> <p>Results:</p>	<p>This paper is not a systematic review but is based on a literature review of several reports by bodies such as the OECD, International Labour Organisation (ILO), trade unions, governments, and business. It contains no effectiveness data</p>

		<p><i>Measures to address labour market adjustment for displaced workers</i></p> <p><u>General measures</u></p> <p>Direct:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unemployment insurance / benefits available to all unemployed workers • Active labour market programs available to all unemployed • Public insurance schemes to cover unpaid entitlements if employer declares bankruptcy without making provision to fully compensate workers <p>Indirect:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Macroeconomic and structural policies to promote growth and employment • Framework' policies to assist efficient reallocation of labour in response to structural change, e.g. housing and labour market policies • Education and training policies to meet and anticipate skill demands <p><u>Targeted measures</u></p> <p>Direct:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Special adjustment or income assistance measures for displaced workers • Employment protection legislation and rules regulating layoffs • Private outplacement services offered to displaced workers by companies or unions 	
--	--	--	--

		<p>Indirect:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Industry redevelopment or rationalisation programmes • Local economic development policies • Trade policies to restrict imports impacting on the industry <p>Systematic government support for displaced workers in Australia</p> <p>Structural Adjustment Programmes: These involve provision of significant funds to a relatively small number of industries and companies, covering less than one per cent of all workers affected by restructuring. This includes four main types of programmes:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Industry Restructuring Programmes: aimed to help industries adapt or adjust to new economic conditions in order to remain viable in the longer term, e.g. automotive, TCF, steel, forestry, fisheries, and taxi industries. 2. Enterprise Assistance Programmes, designed to help individual enterprises remain in the industry e.g. Ford Australia, and BlueScope Steel. 3. Labour Market Programmes, designed to assist individual workers who are displaced through industry transition processes. <p>Investment Attraction Strategies, which provide funding pools typically to attract new investment in affected regions in order to diversify their economies and provide new employment opportunities.</p>	
--	--	---	--

Tabl 3: Echdynnu data o'r astudiaethau sylfaenol sydd wedi'u cynnwys (yn nhrefn yr wyddor)

Reference	Aim/Question	Abstract or summary	Comments
<p>Dixon et al. (2019). Using football cultures as a vehicle to improve mental health in men: the case of the Redcar and Cleveland Boot Room. Sport in Society, 22 (7). pp. 1258-1274. ISSN 1743-0437</p>	<p>To appraise (from the perspective of members) the impact of a localised, football-based mental health intervention: a football themed 'Boot Room' discussion and peer support space.</p>	<p>Study design: Qualitative study</p> <p>Population: Middle aged men who were made redundant from the recent closure of the Sahaviriya Steel Industries (SSI) Steelworks.</p> <p>Location: The borough of Redcar and Cleveland, situated in the Tees Valley region of North Yorkshire in the North East of England.</p> <p>Intervention: A localised community-based mental health intervention - the 'Redcar and Cleveland Boot Room (BR)' – implemented as a forward-thinking mental health strategy, in response to the mass redundancies of steel workers in the North East of England.</p> <p>Outcomes: Mental health resilience</p> <p>Methods: Following discussion with the Boot Room (BR) lead and community health champion, qualitative methods were used to investigate the lived experience of Redcar and Cleveland Boot Room members. Two stages were utilised: stage one involved non-participant observation, where two researchers attended a two hour BR meeting in order establish a rapport with members and to gain a sense of the BR context, to establish discussion points. In stage two the authors returned to hold an</p>	<p>Generalisability: The study took place in England, UK, amongst middle-aged male ex-steelworkers who had experienced mass redundancy. This is very generalisable to the closure and mass unemployment at TATA Steel, Port Talbot. One key difference may be the popularity of rugby in Wales, as opposed to football.</p>

		<p>interactive group discussion lasting one hour and 48 minutes. The discussion, with the permission of the participants was audio recorded and transcribed verbatim to facilitate data analysis. The verbatim transcript was analysed using a manual form of thematic analysis. To minimise subjectivity authors read through the data separately before any categorisation took place. The transcripts were then re-read in full and emergent themes were recorded.</p> <p>Results: Twelve members of the Redcar/Cleveland BR were involved in group discussions. Their ages ranged from 45 to 65 years.</p> <p>The Boot Room utilised a practical and pro-active approach to supporting individual and group members' agendas to help them to manage their adverse circumstances, combined with informality and enjoyment, underpinned by the common language of football and shared social identity.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - football as a metaphor can act as a 'cognitive bridge' which enables personal experiences and emotions to be understood and communicated. - it offers a context for alternative non-medical interventions to develop mental resilience - football culture can be used to underpin an intervention targeting older men, and without the need for structured sessions. - The BR initiative supported member autonomy, with group activities responsive to the needs and interests of members at individual and group level. - The atmosphere and ways of working of the BR enabled members to empathise with one another based on shared experiences, which helped the members to accept advice 	
--	--	--	--

		<p>from, and provide peer support to one another. The latter also served as a medium of spreading knowledge and experience within the BR members</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Wider benefits of the BR (also important for mental health resilience) were opportunities to develop life skills to manage the transition from redundancy to employment (paid and unpaid). Inviting speakers from external agencies to attend BR meetings was an effective medium for health, career, and financial services to positively engage with the members. - helping their families to cope more positively with the often very stark changes to their home lives. 	
<p>O'Brien & Burrows. (2019). Assessing the effectiveness of regional policy responses to mass redundancies: the case of the illawarra region, Australia. Economic Papers: A journal of applied economics and policy, 38(2), 144-155.</p>	<p>To document post-redundancy employment outcomes of steelworkers at a major steelmaker in the Illawarra region (BlueScope Steel) Australia and the Illawarra Region Innovation and Investment Fund (IRIIF) job creation, and offer an evaluation of the effectiveness of these policies.</p>	<p>Study design: Case study - using a longitudinal and mixed methods approach.</p> <p>Population: Redundant steelworkers (ex-BlueScope workers and IRIIF recipients)</p> <p>Location: Illawarra region, New South Wales, Australia</p> <p>Intervention: A federal government \$40 million package consisting of the \$30 million Illawarra Region Innovation and Investment Fund (IRIIF) to attract capital investment to the region to create sustainable and diversified employment, in addition to a \$10 million Labour Market Program (LMP) focusing on Job Service Providers (JSPs) aiding redundant steelworkers regain employment.</p>	<p>This case study utilised a mixed methods approach, however qualitative findings were not reported in detail and no statistical measures of effectiveness of the policy was presented.</p> <p>Limited demographic and outcome data</p>

		<p>Outcomes: Policy effects - employment creation, employment status post-redundancy</p> <p>Methods: Post-redundancy experiences of steelworkers displaced after the 2011 downsizing were traced over an eighteen-month period using longitudinal surveys and interviews. Survey data were collected from ninety-two respondents in May 2012, with a matched sample of fifty-four respondents in July 2013. In addition to the surveys, interviews were conducted with fifteen respondents to collect deeper qualitative insights. Of interest to both survey and interviews were job mobility for workers of different ages, the effectiveness of JSPs in assisting displaced workers find employment and also whether any found jobs in IRIIF organisations. A policy evaluation of IRIIF, and to a lesser extent the LMP administered by JSPs, was also conducted.</p> <p>Results: Employment status – Approximately six months after redundancy (May 2012), 40% of respondents were reemployed, with a labour force participation rate (LFPR) of 66% and an unemployment rate of 40%. The percentage of those employed decreased, and unemployment rates ascended, with older age. Eighteen months post-redundancy, employment rates had increased from 40 to 51%, with a near identical LFPR as May 2012 of 67%, while the unemployment rate had declined from 40 to 25%. The main improvement in unemployment rates came from the older age group of 55 to 59 years.</p>	<p>reported due to lack of data in the public domain and refusal of government agencies to provide data.</p>
--	--	--	--

		<p>While 80% of the unemployed in wave one stated that they were reliant upon their JSP in the months after redundancy, many gave up relying on this means, with the majority indicating that either the Internet or their friends and networks were the means through which they ultimately achieved their new job.</p> <p>Policy evaluation (LMP) – Only 16% attributed their employment success to their JSP, while virtually no respondents who obtained their employment in the following twelve months gave their JSP any credit for their re-employment.</p> <p>Policy evaluation (IRIIF) – twelve projects were approved in manufacturing, nine in IT and five in mining support. Job creation – under 50% (35-39%) of the original job creation target was met. From the scant public data available, thirty-one IRIIF contracts were registered with the Department of Industry in 2013 worth \$25.8 million, but in 2014–2015, this was reduced to twenty-two contracts worth only \$13 million.</p>	
<p>Pfrombeck et al. (2023). Self-affirmation increases reemployment success for the unemployed. Proceedings of the National</p>	<p>To test whether a brief values-based self-affirmation intervention increases the odds of reemployment after a job loss and during unemployment</p>	<p>Study design: Randomised controlled trial</p> <p>Population: Study 1- Chronically unemployed individuals (unemployed for an average 3.21 years). Sample size=334 Study 2- Unemployed individuals who registered at a governmental employment agency (28.2% still working due to notice period and 71.8% already unemployed). Sample size=532.</p>	<p>Study participants, though unemployed, were not explicitly described as having been affected (or at risk of being affected)</p>

<p>Academy of Sciences, 120(37), e2301532120.</p>		<p>Location: Study 1- Participants were based in the USA (24.0%), the UK (28.1%), other European countries (39.9%), and further countries (8.0%).</p> <p>Study 2- All participants were based in Switzerland.</p> <p>Intervention type: A brief psychological values-based self-affirmation intervention.</p> <p>Study 1 – participants were assigned to either a standard self-affirmation writing task or to a control writing task.</p> <p>Study 2 - participants in the intervention group were assigned to the self-affirmation writing task shortly after their registration at the governmental employment agency, while the waiting control group did not complete a writing exercise at this point but were invited to complete the self-affirmation intervention 2 months later.</p> <p>The self-affirmation and control writing exercises were administered online and based on preexisting and pretested material suitable for the job market context</p> <p>Outcome measures:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reemployment success • Number of job offers • Time needed to find new employment <p>Methods: In both studies, participants were randomly assigned to two different experimental conditions (values-based self-affirmation or a control condition). The self-affirmation writing task and the control writing task were based on preexisting and pretested materials suitable for the job market context; and administered online.</p>	<p>by a mass unemployment event.</p> <p>The majority of study participants were based in the USA and Europe, so findings are likely to be generalisable to Wales.</p> <p>An intention to test analyses was conducted.</p>
---	--	--	---

		<p>Study 1: Participants were assigned to either a standard self-affirmation writing task or a standard control writing exercise one week after they had signed up for the study. Two follow-up surveys with a time lag of 2 weeks were conducted after the intervention to obtain information about participants' job search success.</p> <p>Study 2: Participants in the intervention group were assigned to the self-affirmation writing task shortly after their registration at the governmental employment agency, while the waiting control group did not complete a writing exercise at this point. The waiting control group was invited to complete the self-affirmation exercise two months later to ensure that all participants would benefit from the proposed intervention. Staff at the governmental employment agency who directly interacted with study participants were blind to participants' experimental condition and the specific research hypothesis. Two follow-up surveys with a time lag of 4 weeks were conducted after the intervention to obtain information about participants' job search success.</p> <p>Results: <u>Intervention effect on reemployment success</u> Assignment to the self-affirmation condition increased the probability of finding new employment within 4 weeks by a factor of 2.4 in Study 1 ($b = 0.872$, $P = 0.035$, $OR = 2.392$) and by a factor of 3.5 in Study 2 ($b = 1.241$, $P = 0.012$, $OR = 3.461$) compared to a control condition. The probability of finding a job within 4 weeks was 7.5 percentage points higher in the intervention group compared to the control group in Study 2.</p>	
--	--	--	--

		<p>After 8 weeks, the intervention effect wasn't statistically significant in Study 2 ($b = 0.429$, $P = 0.138$, $OR = 1.536$).</p> <p><u>Intervention effect on the time needed to find a new employment</u> In study 2, four weeks after the intervention, the average registration period was significantly lower in the intervention group ($M = 27.6$ d, $SE = 0.30$) than in the control group ($M = 28.7$ d, $SE = 0.27$), $F(1,322) = 7.27$, $P = 0.007$. this tendency increased 8 weeks after the intervention to a difference of 2.56 d, $F(1,322) = 4.14$, $P = 0.043$. The average registration period was significantly lower in the intervention group with 51.11 d ($SE = 0.93$) compared to the control group with 53.67 d ($SE = 0.85$).</p> <p><u>Intervention effect on number of received job offers</u> Participants in the intervention group were significantly more likely to receive job offers within 4 weeks of the intervention compared to the control condition in both studies (Study 1: $b = 0.777$, $P = 0.002$, $OR = 2.175$; Study 2: $b = 0.400$, $P = 0.024$, $OR = 1.492$). Relative to the control condition, the intervention increased the number of job offers by 118% (0.24 extra job offers per person) in Study 1 and by 49% (0.21 extra job offers per person) in Study 2 after 4 weeks. No significant effect found after 8 weeks.</p> <p><u>Intervention effect on reemployment success for individuals aged 50 years and above versus those younger than 50 years</u> The interaction term of the binary age group variable (age 50 years and above vs. below) and the experimental condition was not significant in Study 1 ($b = 0.155$, $P = 0.755$, $OR = 1.167$) nor in Study 2 (after 4 weeks: $b = -0.480$, $P = 0.388$, $OR = 0.619$; after</p>	
--	--	--	--

		8 weeks: $b = -0.112$, $P = 0.728$, $OR = 0.894$). There was also no moderation by age for the number of job offers in either study (Study 1: $b = 0.561$, $P = 0.088$, $OR = 1.753$; Study 2, 4 weeks: $b = -0.151$, $P = 0.515$, $OR = 0.859$; Study 2, 8 weeks: $b = -0.137$, $P = 0.470$, $OR = 0.872$). This lack of significant interaction terms demonstrates that the self-affirmation intervention was equally effective for older and younger job seekers' job search success.	
--	--	--	--

© 2024 Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru Caniateir
atgynhyrchu'r deunydd sydd yn y ddogfen hon o dan delerau'r Drwydded
Llywodraeth Agored (OGL)

www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-governmentlicence/version/3/
ar yr amod bod hynny'n cael ei wneud yn gywir ac na chaiff ei ddefnyddio
mewn cyd-destun camarweiniol.

Dylid cydnabod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru.

ISBN: