



GIG
CYMRU
NHS
WALES

Iechyd Cyhoeddus
Cymru
Public Health
Wales

Name of Meeting

Board

Date of Meeting

30 September 2021

Agenda item:

5.3

TB Outbreak (Llwynhendy) Commissioning of an External Review

Executive lead:	Dr Fu-Meng Khaw, National Director of Health Protection and Screening Services, Executive Medical Director
------------------------	--

Author:	Dr Fu-Meng Khaw, National Director of Health Protection and Screening Services, Executive Medical Director
----------------	--

Approval/Scrutiny route:	Business Executive Team – 20 September 2021
---------------------------------	---

Purpose

To update the Board on the outbreak of Tuberculosis (TB) centred on Llwynhendy, Carmarthenshire and the commissioning, jointly with Hywel Dda University Health Board (HDUHB), of an external review of the management of the outbreak.

Recommendation:

APPROVE X	CONSIDER <input type="checkbox"/>	RECOMMEND <input type="checkbox"/>	ADOPT <input type="checkbox"/>	ASSURANCE X
--------------	--------------------------------------	---------------------------------------	-----------------------------------	----------------

The Board is asked to:

- **Note** the progress on the commissioning, jointly with Hywel Dda University Health Board (HDUHB), of an external review of the management of the TB outbreak in Llwynhendy, Carmarthenshire.
- **Approve** the terms of reference, timeline for the project, and the proposed governance arrangements.

Link to Public Health Wales [Strategic Plan](#)

Public Health Wales has an agreed strategic plan, which has identified seven strategic priorities and well-being objectives.

This report contributes to the following:

Strategic Priority/Well-being Objective	5 - Protecting the public from infection and environmental threats to health
--	--

Strategic Priority/Well-being Objective	Choose an item.
--	-----------------

Strategic Priority/Well-being Objective	Choose an item.
--	-----------------

Summary impact analysis

Equality and Health Impact Assessment	An Equality or Health Impact Assessment has not been undertaken as this is a review of past and recent activity.
--	--

Risk and Assurance	The matters in this report do not relate specifically to any of the BAF, CRR or Directorate risks as written. The plan is to undertake an external review to corroborate the findings of an internal review previously undertaken on 2019, which highlighted several areas of BAF risk.
---------------------------	---

Health and Care Standards	This report supports and/or takes into account the Health and Care Standards for NHS Wales Quality Themes Theme 2 - Safe Care Theme 3 - Effective Care Theme 5 - Timely Care
----------------------------------	---

Financial implications	All external reviewers (including the Project lead) will be taking part in the review as part of their continuous personal development. Reasonable expenses will be offered, although this is expected to be minimal owing to a large proportion of the work being completed remotely.
-------------------------------	--

People implications	Additional project support is required and a team has been formed comprising a project lead, administrator, IT and Comms.
----------------------------	---

1. Purpose / situation

The purpose of this paper is twofold. First, to provide an update on the commissioning, jointly with Hywel Dda University Health Board (H DUHB), of an external review of the management of the incident. Second, to seek the Board's approval of the Terms of Reference, the timelines and governance arrangements for the review.

2. Background

On 9 November 2010 an outbreak investigation was initiated into a cluster of active TB cases with the same genotype profile, occurring in the Llwynhendy area of Carmarthenshire. By the end of 2018, 29 (twenty-nine) cases (in 28 individuals) of active TB disease were linked to the outbreak. In the intervening years the outbreak investigation was re-opened and closed twice. In November 2018 the outbreak investigation was re-opened for the fourth time in response to new cases of TB. The outbreak control team was re-established and wider contact screening was carried out in the local community. At the time of writing, in September 2021, there are now 31 cases associated with this outbreak.

In 2019, a rapid internal review was carried out by Public Health Wales (PHW) to identify immediate actions and to make recommendations for the ongoing management of the outbreak.

The findings of the internal review were presented to a private Board meeting in August 2019. One of the key recommendations of the review was to commission, jointly with Hywel Dda University Health Board (H DUHB), an external review of the outbreak and its management to inform our approach to the management of TB disease in Wales. The Board agreed to proceed with the external review.

In response to the pandemic, a decision was taken early in 2020 to pause the review. In June 2021, following a meeting with H DUHB, the Chief Executives of H DUHB and PHW agreed that the external review should be resumed at the earliest opportunity.

A proposal was taken to a private Board session on 11 August 2021 and there was agreement in principle to resume the process to initiate the external review. This report provides an update on the current situation and seeks approval of the Terms of Reference for the review.

3. Description/Assessment

The Terms of Reference for the review are attached as Appendix A.

Professor Mike Morgan has been appointed as the chair of the external review panel and has been formally commissioned, on 16 August 2021, to oversee the review.

The purpose of the Review is to examine:

- Whether the management of the outbreak since 2010 overall, and at each stage, was conducted in accordance with best practice guidance in place at the time of each phase of the outbreak (with reference to national strategies, plans, guidelines and organisational protocols and procedures);
- The effectiveness of the respective involvement of Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board in the control of the outbreak and treatment of latent or active TB cases at each stage (including the current phase) including the people and financial resources provided by both organisations in response to the outbreak to prevent disease transmission and treat identified TB disease;
- The governance arrangements (including reporting and escalation) for informing Teams and Boards of the outbreak and providing assurance to the Boards of each organisation;
- A review of any reported cases of: 1. People identified over the course of the outbreak who have died where the death certificate identified that TB contributed to or caused the death, and 2. People that have developed active TB;
- The effectiveness of any policy(ies) relevant to TB disease prevention, treatment and control including the management of outbreaks applicable in Wales in each phase of the outbreak and the reporting arrangements within Wales since the outbreak was first declared in 2010;
- The effectiveness of external expert advice sought and obtained including liaison with other organisations, for example, Public Health England (and UK Health Security Agency from October 2021) or the British Thoracic Society.

The review will be undertaken as part of the legal duty of candour for Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board and accordingly, the communication and dissemination of the findings will adopt an open and transparent approach.

The Executive Medical Director at Public Health Wales and the Executive Medical Director at Hywel Dda University Health Board will be the joint Executive sponsors of the review and are accountable to their Boards for the delivery of the Reviewers' report(s).

A Project team will be established to support the review panel. The Project team will be led by a Project manager and will include administrative support, Communications and Information and Communications Technology. The Chair of the Review Panel will work closely with the Project Team to ensure adequate support to the review and review panel members.

Board members will note that a final report will be submitted to and presented at the respective Boards no later than May 2022, with an expectation of a report to QSAC/QSIAC by the end of March 2022.

3.1 Ongoing outbreak management

An outbreak control team (OCT) continues to meet to oversee the coordination, investigation and management of the outbreak. All relevant stakeholders are involved in the OCT on an ongoing basis.

3.2 Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015

This paper is written with due consideration of the five ways of working, as defined within the sustainable development principle in the Act, in the following ways:



Even though Wales has a low prevalence of TB, a long-term commitment is necessary to minimise the threat from the infection.



Prevention is important to minimise the risk of transmission. Measures include surveillance and screening supported by strategic plans and policies.



The response to this outbreak demonstrates the need for a joined up health protection system in Wales that includes national and local clinical and public health services. This will be met through the development of the Health Protection response system for Wales.



Effective prevention and treatment of TB requires close collaboration between public health protection services, local health board TB clinical services and local authority public protection services.



The follow up to this paper will involve senior health protection and microbiology staff together with staff from the local health board and Welsh Government. An external review will involve senior public health and respiratory medicine experts commissioned from outside Public Health Wales and the health board.

4. Recommendation

The conclusions of the jointly commissioned external review of the outbreak and its management will help inform our approach to the management of TB disease in Wales. It will also provide valuable lessons on the system response needed to address infectious diseases and the approach to the management of incidents and outbreaks. This will be helpful alongside the ongoing review of learning from our response to the pandemic.

The Board is asked to:

- **Note** the progress on the commissioning, jointly with Hywel Dda University Health Board (HDUHB), of an external review of the management of the TB outbreak in Llwynhendy, Carmarthenshire.
- **Approve** the terms of reference, timeline for the project, and the proposed governance arrangements.

APPENDIX A

External Review of the Llwynhendy Tuberculosis Outbreak Terms of Reference

1. Scope

- 1.1 An outbreak of *M. tuberculosis* (TB) centred on the Llwynhendy electoral ward in Carmarthenshire, West Wales was first declared in November 2010. Since then an outbreak control team (OCT) has been convened and stood down three times. In November 2018 an OCT was reconvened for the fourth time. This is now delivering a staged approach to community screening that it is hoped will conclude by the end of September 2019.
- 1.2 The Boards of Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board wish to examine whether the outbreak has been managed optimally including whether contact tracing should have been extended at an earlier stage, and whether the clinical care provided to cases was optimal, and if these affected the extent and impact of the outbreak.
- 1.3 Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board have agreed to jointly commission an independent external review to examine these questions as well as to identify the lessons learned from the response to this outbreak and to provide assurance of the current arrangements.
- 1.4 The review will cover the management of the outbreak from November 2010, when first declared, until the present time (August 2021), to identify the actions that have been taken in response to lessons identified.

2. Purpose

- 2.1 The purpose of the Review is to examine:
 - Whether the management of the outbreak since 2010 overall, and at each stage, was conducted in accordance with best practice guidance in place at the time of each phase of the outbreak (with reference to national strategies, plans, guidelines and organisational protocols and procedures);
 - The effectiveness of the respective involvement of Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board in the control of the outbreak and treatment of latent or active TB cases at each stage (including the current phase) including the people and financial resources provided by both organisations in response to the outbreak to prevent disease transmission and treat identified TB disease;
 - The governance arrangements (including reporting and escalation) for informing Teams and Boards of the outbreak and providing assurance to the Boards of each organisation;

- A review of any reported cases of: 1. People identified over the course of the outbreak who have died where the death certificate identified that TB contributed to or caused the death, and 2. People that have developed active TB;
- The effectiveness of any policy(ies) relevant to TB disease prevention, treatment and control including the management of outbreaks applicable in Wales in each phase of the outbreak and the reporting arrangements within Wales since the outbreak was first declared in 2010;
- The effectiveness of external expert advice sought and obtained including liaison with other organisations, for example, Public Health England (and UK Health Security Agency from October 2021) or the British Thoracic Society.

2.2 The review should identify lessons learned and make recommendations to Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board for improvement. There may also be recommendations for other key stakeholders.

3. Reporting and Accountability

3.1 The Executive Medical Director at Public Health Wales and the Executive Medical Director at Hywel Dda University Health Board will be the joint Executive sponsors of the review and are accountable to their Boards for the delivery of the Reviewers' report(s).

3.2 The priority of both organisations at the present time is to continue to manage the outbreak and not distract attention or divert resources from that objective.

3.3 The sponsors would like the review to proceed at pace and are therefore looking to receive an interim Reviewers' report(s) by the end of February 2022 (indicative) with the view to have a preliminary discussion with the Chairs of the Boards and Chief Executives of both organisations prior to a final report being submitted to and presented at the respective Boards no later than May 2022, with an expectation of a report to QSAC/QSIAC by the end of March.

3.4 The Executive sponsors will prepare a joint SBAR for the respective Boards to support the review panel's final report.

3.5 The Reviewer(s) may wish to establish short duration task and finish groups on specific matters of enquiry as and when necessary, for example, a mortality review group and both organisations will give reasonable consideration to requests for any associated necessary resources.

3.6 The Review Project team will report regularly (monthly) on progress of the review to the Executive Sponsor and Executive Team in each organisation.

3.7 If, in the course of the Review, matters are identified that require immediate and urgent action on grounds of public health or quality and

safety of clinical care, then these will be raised, in the first instance, with the Executive Sponsors of the Review to determine whether urgent actions are required.

4. Membership of the review team

4.1 The Reviewers are expected to include:

- A senior public health specialist with expertise in health protection including outbreak control and ideally with demonstrable knowledge of tuberculosis as a public health issue.
- A senior respiratory medicine specialist with expertise in tuberculosis disease.
- A respiratory nurse specialist with expertise in tuberculosis disease.
- A senior microbiologist with expertise in TB diagnosis and expertise in public health microbiology.
- Lay Member: An independent lay representative from a national organisation that has an interest in the treatment and control of tuberculosis and patient outcomes.

The review panel will be chaired by Professor Mike Morgan, previously NHS England's National Clinical Director for Respiratory Disease.

5. Resources to support the review

The commissioning organisations will agree a reasonable request from the reviewers for the resources, human and otherwise, needed to deliver the review. It is expected that this will include access to relevant premises and facilities to conduct necessary activities (meetings etc.); administrative support to assist document retrieval and management, arranging interviews, and the preparation of (a) report(s); retrieval and preparation of case records to support a mortality review; and project management to deliver the review.

A Project team will be established to support the review panel. The Project team will be led by a Project manager and will include administrative support, Communications and Information and Communications Technology. The Chair of the Review Panel will work closely with the Project Team to ensure adequate support to the review and review panel members.

6. Communications and publication of review findings

6.1 The review is undertaken as part of the legal duty of candour for Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board and accordingly, the communication and dissemination of the findings will adopt an open and transparent approach.

- 6.2 A joint Communications Strategy will be agreed by both Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board, that will define the end-to-end process from the initiation of the review to the publication of the findings.
- 6.3 The Communication Strategy will include consideration of the needs of key stakeholders, including members of the public, individuals and families directly affected, Welsh Government, Health Boards, Community Health Councils and Local Authorities.
- 6.4 A joint Communications Plan will include details on plans for publication, including indicative timelines for public meetings and meetings with those directly affected. Where required, earlier contact will be made with individuals and families affected.

Dr Fu-Meng Khaw
Executive Medical Director
Public Health Wales

Dr Philip Kloer
Executive Medical Director
Hywel Dda University Health Board

13 August 2021